

The afterlives of images
-responsible citizenship through media literacy

Gloria J. Brinkman

What the mass media offers is not popular art, but entertainment, which is intended to be consumed like food, forgotten, and replaced by a new dish. ¹
W. H. Auden

Introduction

The opening quote above by W.H. Auden reminds us that our conditioned responses to popular media are built around an insatiable hunger. As citizens in a consumer based, democratic society, students receive coded messages throughout each day delivered through a plethora of media venues aimed at influencing their thoughts and decisions about everything from who to vote for to what to eat. Because our everyday experiences are shaped around media messages it is important that we notice what we see and hear. As educators we have a responsibility to teach our students how to read an object with a view to understand its meaning more deeply. Common Core defines any object that conveys meaning as a “text”. The disciplined reading of media texts- what people write and say, perform and pictorialize- and reflection on what these messages mean is called close reading. Close reading is an important habit.² As emerging citizens, students need to be aware that messages they encounter through media can and do have a significant influence on the way they think and interact with each other. Students have a civic responsibility, therefore, to learn how to read media texts closely to determine meaning.³ Images of everyday experience have become the foundation of identity in our students’ media-rich lives. Social networking, streaming video and a frenzy of visual messages delivered via a plethora of electronic devices both inspire and entice adolescent minds in the course of a typical day. Not only is their cultural “age” being defined by how and when they interact with media, their very histories are being made by the social and aesthetic power of images.⁴ Though students in today’s society have become conditioned to receive communications visually, an aesthetic sensitivity toward those visual impressions is so often lacking and the messages misinterpreted, or missed altogether. Subsequently, it becomes a valuable and necessary personal skill for the 21st century learner to know how to read the messages of others more closely that their lives may be lived more responsibly. This unit examines the pivotal role of the iconic photograph as a communicator of civic responsibility. Though enraptured with the present, and its copious adolescent quandaries, this unit will ask students to look to visual texts of times past to discover in their eloquence a message for tomorrow.

Background : The story of Dorothy and the Culture of our School

The school at which I teach in urban Charlotte, North Carolina holds an especially proud place in civil rights history as one of the first schools in Charlotte to integrate its student

population following the U.S. Supreme Court ruling in favor of desegregation. The historic event, documented in the media, took place on September 4, 1957 as a young 14 year old girl named Dorothy Counts walked through crowds of jeering white students who leveled both verbal and physical abuse toward her as she made her way down the sidewalk and into Harry P. Harding High School. Four days later, Counts's parents withdrew her because of concerns for her safety and sent her to school in Pennsylvania. The images of Dorothy Counts on her first day at Harding High School are now considered iconic and can be accessed online through the Library of Congress photo archives. These images are the inspiration for this unit and serve as a personal motivation for my students' discussions and creative expression in the class activities.

Renamed in 1992 as Harding University High School, the culture of the school has continued to be constructed over time through the migratory nature of urban demographics yet re-constructed through district politics as recently as two years previous to this writing. School progress report data for 2010-2011 reported our adolescent student population at 836 students. Racially our school's demographics at that time consisted of 86.6% African American, 3.3% Hispanic, 4.1 % Asian, 3.6% Caucasian, and 2.4% mixed race. Just two years later, our student population is now over 1618 students. Racially our school's demographics have changed considerably to 69.53% African American, 22.25% Hispanic, 2.97 % Asian, 3.2% Caucasian, and 1.36% mixed race. As a neighborhood school the student population is inclusive of students with physical, emotional, behavioral and learning disabilities. Harding currently has a large number of immigrant students, many of whom are identified as ESL/LEP who are aided through special services.

Until 2011, Harding University High School offered its students a highly successful college-prep academic tract through its magnet curricula in math, science and technology education. In 1992 Harding was a district leader in its initiation of a program of study in the challenging International Baccalaureate Program through which students could earn the highly regarded International Baccalaureate Diploma. Despite countless academic successes and high numbers of college admissions for our economically disadvantaged students the districts' economic turmoil reached a crescendo in 2008 resulting in a 2010 district decision to close our school. Public outcry was strong in both social media and public forum. The district ultimately responded by deciding to keep our school open but merge it with two others resulting in the tripling of our student population and the dissolution of our magnet programs. Within our current context as a neighborhood school, the IB program continues to be offered but is struggling to rebuild having lost most of its student enrollment to schools located elsewhere in the district as parents responded to bad press, fear of crime, and changes in transportation.

Harding University High School has proven resilient and continues to be guided by a mission statement that proclaims that it is a school "where every student matters". Dorothy Counts eventually returned to make her home in Charlotte where she lives to this day. In 2007, 50 years after her historic walk, Dorothy Counts was awarded an honorary diploma from Harding High School. In 2008 Dorothy's iconic 1957 photograph was the focus of an artist-in-residence project at Harding made possible through community

support. In 2009 Harding High School honored Dorothy Counts by dedicating the newly remodeled Library Media Center in her name. Dorothy remains an endeared advocate for our school.

Content objectives and instructional strategies

At Harding University High School, in urban Charlotte, North Carolina, I teach secondary visual art at four different proficiency levels as well as the International Baccalaureate Middle Years Program. My visual art courses are comprised of students representing a wide variety of grades, motivations, skills, and maturities within each class. This unit is appropriate for students in an intermediate level, or year II, visual art course, but is also applicable for social studies or civics and highly adaptive to a class in creative writing. I enjoy using images in my classroom daily to present visual concepts, guide investigations and inspire creative solutions. Adolescent students are naturally curious when viewing and discussing visual images. However, teaching them how to closely read images-specifically how to decode visual clues and determine a substantive evaluation-requires purposefully guided practice. The intention is that meaningful investigation can be driven by this natural curiosity.

Common core state standards for English language arts and literacy extend literacy instruction in history/social studies, science and technical subjects such as fine arts in order to help ensure that all students are college and career ready in literacy by the end of high school. Inherent to the common core standards are specific recommendations that the design of instruction should integrate and evaluate content presented in diverse formats and media, including visually and quantitatively, as well as in words. A 21st century text, therefore, is understood to be much more than an excerpt from a textbook or other printed matter and can include a movie, an image, a tune, an equation, a graph, a performance, or an ad. The range of text types selected for students in grades 6-12 must represent a broad range of cultures and periods. In visual art, the discipline in which I teach, contextual relevancy is an integral component of curriculum addressed by my state's Essential Standards for visual arts instruction. Yet, in any discipline text complexity must be measured by factors centered on levels of meaning, readability measures and reader variables such as motivation, knowledge and experience. Reading closely to determine meaning, described as an Anchor Standard for Reading in North Carolina, is central to developing literacy skills for today's learners. Close reading allows students to determine what a text says explicitly and to make logical inferences from it. It is important to read varied types of texts closely because it helps us to see things about messages that do make a difference in how people think and act. Close reading of varied text types as communicative devices is now key to North Carolina's common core standards for English language arts and literacy and is supported through all subject disciplines, including technical subjects such as visual art. An approach to understanding the communicative aspects of selected iconic visual texts will be the focus of this curriculum unit. The goal is that adolescent students become knowledgeable of some techniques of close reading and develop critical skills through which they can interpret meaning in texts they encounter thus growing their skills in media literacy.

The content goal of this curriculum unit, based on close reading of iconic images, is to challenge students to develop analytic and critical thinking skills that empower them not only to evaluate select media texts but also to use them as inspiration for creative artistic expression. This unit offers several class activities useful in guiding students in their viewing and discussion of specific iconic images to determine rhetorical point of view, compositional elements, and socially shared meaning. Through the application of select rhetorical theories and methods for close reading students will look at the work of artists and photographers who use their art to challenge society's perceptions of our lives and how we live them in the world today. The pivotal role of the iconic photograph is examined as a communicator of civic responsibility. Through small group discussions students will collaborate to identify concerns about students' collective attitudes towards civic responsibility as demonstrated on campus. Students will conceive of and create persuasive media messages in support of civic ideals for the school culture while utilizing recognizable iconic photographs. Students will appropriate photographs considered iconic to U.S. public culture along with others selected from public archives that are of particular historical significance to the civil rights history of our urban public school and the city of Charlotte, NC. Using digital photography and iPad technology, as modern communicative media, students will reinterpret iconic photographs creating promotional messages about civic responsibility intended for their school-based audience. Through their creation of video montage and MTV-style photo essays students will attempt to deliver persuasive visual texts to influence peer behaviors towards civic responsibility in an effort to contribute to growing a positive school culture. The intention in these activities is to inspire adolescents to develop life long habits of close reading as well as heightened civic awareness as they consider the communicative power of images in their everyday lives through media literacy.

Guiding Questions for this unit include the following:

What is "close reading"?

What are some techniques of close reading?

What is rhetoric and how is it understood in close reading?

How is close reading a civic responsibility?

What is an iconic image?

How do iconic photographs communicate concepts of civic responsibility?

How do close readings of iconic photographs communicate socially shared meanings?

What types of media images are likely to strongly influence us?

How can close reading of iconic images be useful in examining perceptions of current school culture?

How can appropriations of iconic photographs be creatively employed to promote civic responsibility for adolescent students?

Rationale

Hariman and Lucaites elaborate on the notion of iconicity as it relates to photojournalistic images. The term “icon” is used to refer to a wide range of images that, through their repetitive use, have become emblematic visual symbols spanning times and cultures. “Culture” refers to the manner in which social practices such as speech, writing, the arts, architecture, entertainment and fashion come together to structure our perceptions, thoughts, emotions, and conduct. Photojournalistic icons, as public art, are representative of public culture and function as visual texts to define how we are to equip ourselves to do the social, political, and ethical work required to live together.⁵ In light of these concepts, I conceived of this unit to guide my students in examining select iconic photographs for how they might address specific relational and social concerns of present day school culture.

The clearest example of an icon is a photograph.⁶ A photograph of your mother, in its patterns of light and dark, color and texture on the photographic paper resembles her. When a photograph comes to have widely shared meanings it is referred to as an artifact. In addition, an artifact represents an action, event, or object that is perceived as a unified whole, while manifesting group identification to us.⁷ The photographs of 9/11, for example are artifacts that are capable of manifesting identification with American patriotism in the wake of domestic terrorism. There are only a few photographs in the history of U.S. public culture considered to be iconic artifacts for their capability to visually persuade us toward democratic ideals and civic consciousness. This select group of photojournalistic images serves as visual signs of public address because they shape and inform public notions of citizenship. In their book *No Caption Needed*, Hariman and Lucaites defend photojournalism as an artistic form of public address with the iconic photograph as its crowning achievement.⁸ They defend photojournalistic icons as

those photographic images appearing in print, electronic, or digital media that are widely recognized and remembered, are understood to be representations of historically significant events, activate strong emotional identification or response, and are reproduced across a range of media, genres, or topics.⁹

Like a venerated religious icon, these images activate varied levels of ritual and emotional response. They seem to bear more than documentary value in bearing witness to something that exceeds words.¹⁰ The iconic journalistic photo has been able to activate public consciousness in ways that verbal or written texts alone cannot, bringing together in a single image such moral circumstances as pain, fragmentation, relationships among strangers, betrayal, and trauma.¹¹ Iconic photographs continue to define the past in ways that evoke contemporary public debate and their appropriations reveal much about public culture.¹²

Photographic icons are works of art, specifically public art, grounded in the experiences of a democratic society and oriented toward the dilemmas and decisions of everyday life.¹³ The rhetorical power of iconic photojournalistic images comes from their ability to reproduce ideologies of everyday experience while communicating social knowledge. Their content, in light of their context, shape collective memory, provide performative models of citizenship, and provide figurative resources for stimulating communicative

action.¹⁴ In this unit, selected photojournalistic icons are examined for their power to communicate ideals of civic responsibility and their potential as persuasive texts capable of motivating individuals within school culture towards more civil actions. Learners need distinct spaces both for acquiring and practicing literacy skills as well as room to practice their integration of literacy in meaningful events. Through an outward-looking view of learning students not only learn how to participate in literacy events in school but also become alert to the changing cultural expectations about literacy activities that operate out of school.¹⁵ If students can develop a flexibility of literacy practice they will be better able to respond directly to the expectations of the local community or work cultures as responsible citizens.

Learning goals integral to the common core standards are focused on getting students to think more deeply and make the kinds of connections that enhance the development of effective literacy skills. Effective literacy allows learners to break the code of texts, participate in both understanding and composing meaning, and to use texts functionally in life. Effective literacy makes it possible that students are able to critically analyze and transform texts by acting on knowledge that texts are not ideologically natural or neutral—that they represent particular points of view while silencing others and influence people’s ideas. Effective literacy allows students to learn how the design and the discourse in a text can be critiqued and redesigned in novel and hybrid ways.¹⁶ These concepts form the creative basis for class activities in this unit.

Rhetorical persuasion in our everyday lives

Preliminary class activity

This activity can serve as an introduction to the concept of rhetoric and its presence in our daily lives. This exercise asks students to consider how a commonly held notion becomes born in you and is then maintained in your everyday experiences through your exposure to persuasive influences. This exercise is adapted from *Rhetoric in Popular Culture* by Barry Brummett.¹⁷

One example of a commonly held belief is: It is important to look and feel nice. Students will think about this belief and write reflectively in response to leading questions. Specifically, when and where did you come to share this belief? What specific experiences can you remember that influenced you to hold this belief? To help in thinking this through students will write down some particular experiences that fall into the following categories:

Television commercials	Movies	Popular music	Teachers	Talking with friends
Magazine ads	Faith communities	Television dramas or comedies	Family discussions	Internet blogs

The widely held belief that it is important to look and smell nice is rather common sense for most Americans. It is also true that there are people in positions of authority or established power within the society that want the public to hold to this belief. When the public holds certain beliefs it follows that certain arrangements of power and privilege are maintained. If it is widely held that it is important to smell nice, then consumers run out and buy lots of perfumes, deodorants, soaps and other items that keep manufacturers of such products wealthy and powerful. However, we do not always accept powerful influences. Sometimes we don't "go with the flow" of popular ideas and feel like we are in the minority in the tide of public opinion. Ask students to think of another widely held popular belief but this time it is one they disagree with. For example: What I wear shows how smart I am. Going back to the above list of influences students should write about how they developed an ability to resist a popular idea. Students will respond to the question: How did you learn to struggle against a widely held idea?

Iconic images and civic responsibility

According to communications scholar Barry Brummett, close reading of media images is important to individuals both socially and personally. Close reading is important socially because as citizens in a public community we need to understand how messages we hear and see may influence the public in important ways. Instances of racism and inequalities targeted at ethnic groups may come to influence us in subtle ways, as seemingly insignificant as signage in an amusement park. Public citizens need to be vigilant as to the meanings and possible effects of the messages we encounter. Close reading can help us to do that and therefore becomes more than an indispensable survival skill, it becomes a civic responsibility. From a personal consideration, close reading is important in helping an individual understand and appreciate differences in language, tone, dialect, words and actions thus aiding in the process of just getting along with others different than oneself.¹⁸ Among diverse populations the ability to read others and their messages is important.

The class activities in this unit can help in growing adolescent students' appreciations for meaningful citizenship through the decoding of messages delivered through specific photojournalistic images notable for their capacity to evoke civic mindedness. Students consider how to analyze visual components inherent in specific archived photographs considered iconic in U.S. culture while determining their rhetorical point of view. Students grow to understand that appropriation of images grounded in a culture is part of their iconicity. Students then create visual expressions in response to civic responsibilities within school culture. The development of habits of close reading is the overarching goal of this unit. Habits of close reading will facilitate the creation of meaning through the text and help to ensure that the afterlife of the image beckons such encounters.

In the 1990s scholars in visual culture studies abandoned the notion that language alone constituted reality. Increasing emphasis was placed on the power of the visual in art, science and everyday life.¹⁹ This was dubbed the "visual turn" as scholars theorized against text-centric methods as the only valid way of understanding culture. Convinced

that “meaning is not read but seen”, they favored a visual vernacular over a textual, high cultured approach emphasizing the way in which meaning is constructed. Contemporary studies in communication theory acknowledge the “cross mediated” relationships between visuality, textuality and other sensory and expressive modes of communication. As Blair writes,

...there is virtually no aspect of contemporary reality that remains outside the reach of visual theory; no image, perception, sensation, experience, or social process not subject to apprehension in terms of visual epistemologies, rhetorics, and practices.²⁰

What type of text would be most meaningful for today’s students’ exploration of these “cross mediated” relationships? Despite the broad range of topics that continue to define the study of visual culture, the one focal point for work on the interrelationships of visuality and textuality has been photography. The photograph is the one familiar object charged with both knowledge and subjectivity that has formed and informed our social being. Long ignored by traditional art historians as the product of mechanical devices, the photograph is now considered instrumental as a mode of transparent evidence, a distinctive object that has social meaning in contexts coded by narrative. The very word “photograph” comes from “light writing”, in effect conveying the notion of an oscillation between legibility and visibility, between reading and viewing, between representation and fiction. In 21st century terms the photograph, with its generational offshoots of video and digital imaging, can cause us to question the very nature of visuality.²¹ In other words, how is the history of our everyday experiences, as documented through media images, representative of our social and civic identity? What do media images tell us about how to treat each other? One of the primary goals of this unit is to empower adolescent students to develop habits of effective visual literacy through responding to select photojournalistic images considered to be civic icons. Because they are representative of their epoch, photojournalistic icons serve as models of citizenship. Through the framing of civic-minded texts for close reading, the stakes for adolescent students become high because of the way iconic images can mediate the individual’s experience of meaningful citizenship itself.

Close reading through iconic photographs

Art constitutes culture, and public arts constitute a public culture.²²

In their book *No Caption Needed*, Hariman and Lucaites discuss the unique communicative powers of a small set of photographic images considered to be icons of U.S. public culture. These images, having been widely reproduced, are easily recognized by people of varied backgrounds and elicit complex emotional responses. Beyond their documentary value as historical objects they are visual texts that are useful in orienting an individual to the broad context of collective public identity and civic obligation.²³ As objects of contemplation, iconic photographs function much like a religious icon capable of ritual response. Through their aura of history and deep sense of humanity they have become sacred images for a secular society.²⁴ I found the authors’ discussion of several

iconic images to be of particular relevance to a unit such as this unit in facilitating its focus on cultural identity and civic responsibility. I recommend the following: *Migrant Mother*, 1936 by Dorothea Lange, *Flag Raising on Mount Suribachi*, *Iwo Jima* by Joe Rosenthal and *Accidental Napalm*, 1972 by Nick Ut. I have included in this unit a lesser known iconic image for consideration as it relates to the class activities. The image is titled *Dorothy Counts* and can be found in the photographic archives of the National Library of Congress. The image is of particular historic significance to the school at which I teach in urban Charlotte, North Carolina as it documents the aforementioned epic moment in civil rights history that took place at this school in 1957.

The seeming nature of iconic images is that they construct a community's sense of the past. Across time and culture, available technologies of representation have been used to situate life in the present within a formal composition framed by a context of meaning that is unthreatened by change. These representations have taken many forms from ancient verse to renaissance pieta to black and white photograph. An important consideration of iconic photographs is their accessibility. They are undemanding images that provide a more or less idealized sense of who we are, what we ought to be and a provide a personal affiliation with large scale events.²⁵ The historic photograph of Dorothy Counts as an icon of civil rights in the lived experience of an adolescent serves just such a purpose for the present day Harding University High School community.

Photographic images now considered iconic were first experienced by the public while going through the ordinary routines of their everyday lives, seeing an image in a magazine in the dentist's office or watching the evening news. Whether documenting victory or disaster, iconic images stand out above the billions of other images scattered throughout media spaces reflecting a variety of forms of social, political and artistic consciousness. Hariman refers to iconic photographs as "a public art grounded in the experiences and aspirations of a democratic society and oriented toward the problems and rewards or ordinary life."²⁶ Democracy is described here as being lodged in the realm of middle class human experience thriving on middlebrow sensibilities, getting by on mediocre education and living life day by day. Though democratic societies produce popular artworks in contemporary media such as film, television and music that are capable of reflective examination of the social order, the iconic photograph is oriented toward reflective awareness of social constructs that can lead individuals to make decisions on behalf of democratic ideals. The artistic eloquence found in iconic photographs becomes the basis for an idealism essential for the continuation of democratic practice.²⁷ Artistic eloquence is recognized through critical analysis of the elements and principles of design as artistic devices present in a composition.

Photojournalistic Icons

Photojournalism is characteristically democratic art, and the iconic photo is its signature work.²⁸

Photography itself is a characteristic art of the modern era, hailed since its inception as a democratic medium-widely accessible, requiring little skill to produce, little money to acquire photos, an object of popular interest, largely devoted to depicting ordinary people and everyday life.²⁹ Hariman defines photojournalistic icons as

those photographic images appearing in print, electronic, or digital media that are widely recognized and remembered, are understood to be representations of historically significant events, activate strong emotional identification or response, and are reproduced across a wide range of media, genre, or topics.³⁰

Iconic images can have a distinctive influence on public opinion and, depending on which part of the U.S. public culture they operate in, responses of one kind can be more likely than others. Though meaning can be found through examining the rhetorical dimension of an image this is not the only way to determine its significance. Hariman and Lucaites identify the following five “vectors of influence” that seem important for photojournalism and particularly for iconic photographs: reproducing ideology, communicating social knowledge, shaping collective memory, modeling citizenship, and providing figural resources for communicative action. Each iconic photographic image operates as a distinctive element of public culture in the U.S. and by following one of these paths of influence a pattern of motivation can be determined.³¹

Ideology – a set of beliefs that presents a social order as if it were a natural order. When people appear in photographs they are presented as they are naturally and socially. A photograph can display variations of gendered display that are used to understand social structure.³²

Social knowledge – persuasive discourse works when it effectively taps into the unspoken knowledge held by the audience as members of society. A photographic text can activate deep structures of belief that guide social interaction and civic judgement. Photographs are also a mute record of social performance as they articulate a model for civic life.³³ Photographic images have externalized how we imagine community by showing images of people acting together in many different locales, subcultures and preoccupations of a large, pluralistic society. Citizens see one another in common circumstances such as working, waiting in line, celebrating or demonstrating.³⁴

Shaping collective memory – while photojournalism typically documents the present, iconic photojournalism is highly oriented toward the past. As such they shape understanding of specific events and periods. Collective memory is constructed through the visual media thus iconic photos continue to be used to frame an understanding of public life for later generations.³⁵

Modeling citizenship - the photographic image is unmatched at revealing at a glance the “deep rules” that prescribe interactions in public places. Photographs not only expose but also model social behaviors that constitute citizenship as an embodied identity. Iconic images provide a civic education, “for better or worse”.³⁶

Because photojournalism consists of images of individuals one does not know personally, it creates its own deep rule of citizenship: the habit of being benignly attentive towards strangers.³⁷

Providing figural resources - Because of their formal eloquence and wide circulation iconic photographs provide performative models of citizenship through the figurative subjects they portray. That these images are appropriated and imitated by the public is part of their iconicity as they become identified with the visual artistry of the public.³⁸

In looking at iconic photographs, we read first on the surface-clothing styles, postures, facial expressions, gestures, but how do we go deeper? What should a closer reading look like? Barry Brummett defines close reading as a mindful, disciplined reading of an object or text with a view to deeper understanding of its meanings.³⁹ This calls us to think about what close reading entails. Who does the text invite us to be? Is there anything in the text that invites us to stand beside a particular person or situation? Are we the onlookers, the bystanders, the jeering crowd or are we called upon by the text to be wiser? Do we recognize that we need to overcome some social habits? Do we sentimentally align ourselves with the individuals and situation depicted or do we take a superior stance? Are we called to see ourselves, or take a smug position against how mistaken someone else is?⁴⁰ This is the nature of critical close reading. Close reading always has ethical dimensions. Trying to get someone to read a text closely and critically invites people to see the world differently and that can be risky. Reading closely for deeper understanding implies a sense of ethical responsibility.⁴¹ In order to help students understand how iconic photographs pose these questions, refer to the following five elements of visual rhetoric found in the iconic photograph as described by Hariman and Lucaites.⁴²

Aesthetic familiarity- artistry shapes moral judgment. Iconic photos are structured by familiar patterns of artistic design that flow from certain conventions of accepted middlebrow art such as landscape and portrait. They do not feature techniques of more avant-garde photographic art such as sharp contrast or double exposures. Iconic images draw upon popular iconography (such as mother and child, soldiers in uniform), representational realism (everything to scale, no exaggerations), journalistic conventions (balanced compositions, a sense of dignity), and visual grammars learned from film and advertising.

Civic performance-the iconic photo mediates public life as it embodies conventions of personal autonomy or human rights⁴³ Operating much like a theatrical performance, the framing of the photographic image marks the work as a special selection of reality, occurring at a specific time and place, and marks a moment's intensity as being greater than moments before it or after it. The iconic photograph communicates through social actors, gestures and fashions drawing on social knowledge to structure understanding, motivate action, and organize collective memory. The image is composed to persuade by allowing us as viewers to see ourselves in social mirrors, in the eyes and reactions of others. We see ourselves as citizens, consumers, imperialists, dissenters, Americans, moderns, members of the family of humankind.⁴⁴

Semiotic transcriptions - specific shifts of meaning occur as a reader is cued by artistic, social, and political codes providing the interpretations of events in a coherent manner . Because the camera records everyday life, the photographic image communicates across a wide variety of cultural norms, artistic genres, political styles, ideographs, social types, rituals of interaction, poses, gestures and other signs as they intersect each other in any event. Collective experience becomes defined by the iconic image as these codes are “fused together.”⁴⁵

Emotional scenarios (powerful emotional experiences) - the iconic image constructs a scenario in which specific emotional responses to a specific event become the basis for understanding and action. Through bodily expression the photograph displays emotions that affect the viewers’ relationship with the people in the picture. The dramatic enactment of specific body positioning, gesture, and posture creates an exchange of emotion as the image is circulated. These emotions take on added significance when they become political emotions, such as civic pride or outrage. Feelings of pleasure or pain can become political in complex ways over the history of time.⁴⁶

Contradictions and crisis- A crucial function of the iconic photograph is that it embodies a basic contradiction or recurrent crisis within society. The image constructs a moral response among citizens to problems deeply rooted in the public culture at the time. A conflict can emerge to crisis when events reveal how the prevailing political system fails in its service to the public. Such conflicts are provocative of powerfully charged emotions that are not easily controlled. Circulation and subsequent appropriation of the iconic image allows for continued revisiting and rethinking of the original event to elaborate on questions of justice. Societies are grounded in conflicts for which there are no definitive remedies. The visual icon serves as an aesthetic resource for performing conflict mediation.⁴⁷

Class activity

The information in the following chart presents a comparison of three photojournalistic visual texts as a springboard for class discussion aimed at identifying the five elements of visual rhetoric found in the iconic photograph.⁴⁸ Three singular works are offered as exemplars of the iconic photograph, specifically *Migrant Mother*, 1936 by Dorothea Lange, *Flag Raising on Mount Suribachi, Iwo Jima*, 1945 by Joe Rosenthal and *Accidental Napalm*, 1972 by Nick Ut.

Explore the five elements of visual rhetoric as found in these iconic photographs.			
Element	<i>Migrant Mother</i> , 1936 by Dorothea Lange	<i>Flag Raising on Mount Suribachi, Iwo Jima</i> , 1945 by Joe Rosenthal	<i>Accidental Napalm</i> , 1972 by Nick Ut
Aesthetic familiarity	classical symmetry as found in	sculptural qualities showing no facial	a young naked child is the central figure

	Renaissance images of Madonna and Christ child, sharp contrasts of light and shadow, strong visual movement along directional lines flowing from mother's face	expressions but strenuous physical exertion through gestural body expressions, dark tones suggest the sweat of honest labor resonant of a genre painting ⁴⁹	in a war torn landscape running right toward you, her pain is the primary fact of her experience which she projects at the viewer. The face of the boy in front of her resembles Edvard Munch's famous painting <i>The Scream</i> ⁵⁰
Civic performance	irony of capitalism, loss of personal security and happiness, a call to collective action to do something to alleviate suffering	political community, the men are anonymous while working together, the flag raising demonstrates common labor for a common goal	constructs public judgment of the war, confronts U.S. citizens with the immorality of their actions
Semiotic transcriptions (the making of coherent meaning)	generalized anxiety made real by conventional attributions of gender	the flag makes their labor a purposeful action while the group's work to raise it embodies the nation	importance of features of a moral life including pain, fragmentation, betrayal and trauma
Emotional scenarios	despair and vulnerability, natural scarcity and emotional desolation, paralyzing fear of poverty	the men are prepared to continue in their labor for the military without regard for their personal safety even unto death	trauma, represented through key tensions in society's relationships among strangers; acts devoid of heroism
Contradictions and crisis	the mother's face evokes all the suffering of mankind but all the perseverance too ⁵¹ , public audience in place of an absent father ⁵²	features only men, an idealized embodiment of working-class routine as well as military service ⁵³ ; actual conditions in society denied equality to women and people of color in the workforce ⁵⁴	war is coded into a single individual's experience; democratic dissent-the U.S. military's daily body counts and free-fire zones hid the fact that propriety was set aside for a moral purpose ⁵⁵

Critical close reading, a Pentad analysis

Rhetorical scholar Kenneth Burke developed a general theory for use in critical close reading of texts that states that motivations follow from language use. One method suggested by Burke to enable the use of that theory is referred to as the Pentad. The Pentad is based on the metaphor of a drama. Burke says that language motivates people to think of the world as if it were a dramatic production. The Pentad has five parts as listed in the chart below. One of these terms, or a combination of these five will usually be stressed over the others. Examine the [text] language to see which of the terms is being emphasized. Language seems to suggest that the audience, the reader, will adopt motives based on act, agent, agency, scene, or purpose.⁵⁶

Healthy democracies are those where citizens are accustomed to arguing thoughtfully about how they are influenced.⁵⁷

Class Activity

The following three tables illustrate how one might apply the pentad method to a comparative reading of three visual texts, each of which depicts an African American female who is being escorted by adult males. Create a slide presentation for the images cited in the tables below. Frame them singly and then in close comparison to each other, side by side, almost as if rubbing against each other. This will create a visual tension that positions the images closely for using the analysis provided. Several likely possibilities are offered for the students to consider in the larger context of the visual representation of race and civic responsibility. When using the pentad the making of meaning occurs when considering the ratios of the elements in the pentad. Ratios are the relationships between items in the pentad. A scene-agent ratio, for example would emphasize how the scene shapes attitudes toward the agent. In the example below, the integration of public schools is the scene within which Dorothy Counts is considered an important agent.

Pentad terms:

Act, the kind of things that are done

Agent, the person or group who does the action

Agency, the means by which action is performed

Scene, the context in which the action takes place

Purpose, the underlying reasons, goals, and philosophies that guide action

Text: Dorothy Counts, 1957, Library of Congress photo archives	
Source: http://www.loc.gov/pictures/item/96520936/	
Pentad term	Suggested language as emphasized in this text
Act	Dorothy Counts walking into the formerly all white school
	The integration of the public schools by the federal government.
Agent	Dorothy Counts, a solitary, young, well-dressed black female surrounded by white students and adults.

	(for alternative perspective) The jeering, mocking crowd
	(for alternative perspective) The men assigned to protect Counts
Agency	The protective escort as agency (of Federal desegregation mandate)
	The Supreme Court decision as agency.
	The federal desegregation mandate as agency.
Scene	The scene (culturally) is a previously segregated school in NC, a historically important desegregation event, or the larger nationwide program of public school desegregation.
Purpose	The purpose is desegregation, (related) racial equality, or the implementation of federal law

<i>The Problem We All Live With</i> , Norman Rockwell, 1964	
Source: http://www.kingsacademy.com/mhodes/11_Western-Art/27_Popular_Modern-Realism/Rockwell/Rockwell_1964_The-Problems-We-All-Share.jpg	
Pentad term	Suggested language as emphasized in this text
Act	Ruby Bridges is walking, being escorted to school, followed closely in front and behind by marshalls
	A tomato is hurled past Ruby, striking the wall as she passes
Agent	Ruby Bridges, a young well-dressed African American girl
	(for alternative perspective) Four anonymous marshals escorting Ruby and dressed in business suits
	(for alternative perspective) The angry mob, out of frame, their presence made known by the tossed tomato
Agency	The protective escort as agency (the two forward marshalls seem to block Ruby from going past them, the other two marshalls keep their distance, thus isolating the child)
	The federal desegregation mandate as agency.
Scene	The first black student to attend formerly all white William-Frantz Public School in New Orleans, Louisiana Integrated neighborhoods and schools (historically important desegregation contexts). A dangerous moment for Bridges (as marked by her protective escort and the thrown tomato and racially offensive graffiti)
Purpose	Desegregation or (related) racial equality, the implementation of federal law

Rihanna, in Rio, 2011	
Source: http://cdn01.cdn.justjared.com/wp-content/uploads/2011/09/rihanna-rio/thumbs/rihanna-airport-rio-de-janeiro-09.jpg	
Pentad term	Suggested language as emphasized in this text
Act	Rihanna walks through airport terminal
	Admirers are held at bay, stopped from getting close to Rihanna
Agent	Rihanna as a confident star Rihanna as a survivor of domestic violence (for alternative perspective) Armed guards protecting Rhianna (for alternative perspective) Paparazzi

	(for alternative perspective) admirers and fans
Agency	Celebrity/talent as agency Money, fame as agency
Scene	An airport terminal in Rio de Janeiro, Brazil in South America
Purpose	Balancing publicity needs for a popular star against security risks

The Pentad analysis offers rich motivations for argumentative or comparative essays. Refer to the full text of the article by Victoria Gallagher and Kenneth Zagacki listed in the resources for this unit. Their article gives an excellent critical close reading of the artistic devices used by Rockwell in communicating a rhetorical view of school desegregation and the integration of neighborhoods. This image that appeared in *Look* magazine was very different than Rockwell's nostalgic images of Americana done as covers for the *Saturday Evening Post*. In the early 1960's Rockwell had been told that he could not include images of Negroes in his illustrations for *Post* covers unless they were doing menial tasks. His images done in response to civil rights issues appeared inside *Look* magazine, not the cover, but were artfully constructed to present his democratic point of view on civil rights.

Iconoclasts

Iconic images are important not only for their appeal and the role they play in public culture. Their true rhetorical power lies in their consideration as iconoclasts, as images that through appropriation extend a cultural ideal across time and space. A perfect example of this iconoclast status can be seen in the famous post 911 photograph that depicts three firefighters raising the American flag above the debris field in the wake of the collapse of the World Trade Center. *Three Firefighters Raising the American Flag* was taken in 2001 by Thomas Franklin yet is striking in its similarities of both structure and meaning to *Flag Raising on Mount Suribachi, Iwo Jima*, 1945 by Joe Rosenthal. Thomas Franklin later remarked about his own image, “[a]s soon as I shot it, I realized the similarity to the famous image of Marines raising the flag at Iwo Jima.”⁵⁸ The widespread appropriation of common images is an important element of public culture. Because they are widely shared and circulated, the public citizen uses iconic photographs to develop personal attitudes and self-understandings of a democratic society amidst historical changes. As images circulate, they move across audiences capable of seeing both continuity and incongruity. Therefore, the public acts of copying, imitating, satirizing, and other forms of image appropriation are considered to be crucial signs of iconicity.⁵⁹ Appropriations of iconic photos prove that common images are useful to both model normative behavior or satirize it through mimicry, thereby challenging accepted norms of artistic invention for purposes both serious and silly.⁶⁰ The inherent permission to appropriate iconic photographs can spark creative inspiration in the adolescent student.

Class activity

Accidental “Bully”, an appropriation of *Accidental Napalm*, 1972 by Nick Ut

The public media display the public to itself. They put the state (the school) on display and valorize some behaviors over others.⁶¹

In this class activity, students will create a democratic response to school culture through imitation and appropriation of the iconic photograph *Accidental Napalm*, taken in 1972 by Nick Ut. In this famous Viet Nam war photo a naked little girl is running down the road toward the camera while screaming in pain from the napalm burns on her back and arm. Other Vietnamese children are hurriedly running down the road near to her. One boy's face is so filled with terror it reminds one of the screaming figure in the painting *The Scream* by Edvard Munch. The little girl has been stripped of her clothes, her arms held out from her sides as if her skin has been flayed. In the background soldiers walk casually, while rolling smoke from the drop of the napalm billows across the back of the scene.⁶² Though her burns are not visible the pain and terror on her face confront the viewer. Deep pain, especially a child's pain, conveys a sense of rupture or breaking apart of the social world that one would expect to keep a child safe and happy. This photojournalistic text communicates a condition of moral fragmentation through which the viewer can be persuaded to make a judgment about public responsibility. Yet, the little girl and all those around her are strangers. Because photojournalistic images maintain a vital relationship between strangers, through common acts of spectatorship in lived experiences, they provide a vital resource for helping us to see ourselves and form concepts of civic identity.⁶³ In appropriating *Accidental Napalm*, students should try to re-visualize the characters and setting in terms of fragmentations in social relationships within school culture. The little girl, though clothed, might be visualized as a bullied teen whose pain is unnoticed by the other students passing by while walking between classes on the school campus. Digital media or any two dimensional traditional media could ably be used in students' creative interpretations of this theme.

Schools in America face daily challenges in encouraging the growth of positive school culture through anti-bullying and other peer acceptance programs. Students will develop 21st century skills through collaboration, working together toward common goals and developing and defending values. Students will voice their opinions about the lived experience of school culture reflecting on questions such as: How do we define our school's culture today? What are the challenges for social acceptance faced by students at our school, for example, cliques, disassociation, relationships, cultural acceptance, bullying? What does it feel like to be ostracized, bullied, and left out? What are some goals for school culture such as working together, accepting differences, and celebrating diversity? What might be some solutions for growing a more positive school culture?

Through small group discussions students will collaborate to identify concerns about students' collective attitudes towards civic responsibility as demonstrated on campus. Students will conceive of and create persuasive media messages in support of civic ideals for the school culture through the recreating of recognizable iconic photographs. Guided discussions should help students understand what appropriation is and how it is to be approached in consideration of audience appropriate imagery and rules of copyright. Students will appropriate photographs considered iconic to U.S. public culture. Using digital photography and iPad technology, as modern communicative media, students will

reinterpret iconic photographs creating promotional messages and public service announcements (PSA's) about civic responsibility intended for their school-based audience. Through the creation of video montage and MTV-style digital photo essays students will aim to deliver persuasive visual texts to influence peer behaviors towards civic responsibility. Students will deliver their media messages to the student body publically via closed circuit school based media broadcasts or upload to school based media blogs.

Class activity

Perceptions of school culture - a photo essay

Consider these generalizations about perceptions:

Perceptions are rooted in culture.

Perceptions are created by experience.

Perceptions affect self-image, identity and how we take care of ourselves.

Perceptions influence what we value.

Perceptions have economic impact.

Perceptions influence how we relate to the natural world.

Perceptions change over time.

Create a photomontage using iPad technology. A montage video is made up of still photographs that are electronically linked with interesting affects that allow the video to show emotion and slight movement. You can create a montage video by using photos that you have previously taken. At its simplest, it is a slide show. But, a slide show that displays a series of still photos with no transitions, effects, or audio is quite dry. An effective montage uses transitions, effects, and audio to bring the still photos to life and a give a sense of movement.

Class Activity

Migrant Mother on MTV

Public texts are complex mediations of experience.⁶⁴

This class activity explores abstract analogy, exploring the creative interplay of contemporary visual style and iconic photojournalistic images. Research the Migrant Mother as a photo essay by viewing the series of photos that led to that one iconic image that made Dorthea Lange famous. Recreate it present day staged to represent the plight of the teenage mother, single parent family, extended family, grandmother as caregiver, or absence of father figure. Research the analogical connections between visual style and cultural values. Consider "MTV-style" camerawork and editing- a style characterized by jump cuts, camera jiggle, swish pans, tilted framing, eccentric cropping, and the like. These stylistic traits are rebellious of the more traditional or accepted rules of visual composition in traditional film and television and are expressive of youthful rebellion.

Discuss how this style of pictorial representation can be a conduit for conveying concepts of civic mindedness to today's youth.

Anchor Standards for Writing

Example: Write narratives to develop real or imagined experiences or events using effective technique, well-chosen details, and well-structured event sequences.

Vocabulary/terms

Text, close reading, critical close reading, text, icon, iconic, photojournalism, visual text, interpretation, collaboration, contemporary, civic, civil rights, perspective, paradox, persuasive, argumentative, composition, citizenship, democracy, civic responsibility, appropriation, video montage, rhetoric, pentad

Bibliography

Sara Blair. "The Photograph's Last Word : Visual CultureStudies Now." *American Literary History* (Oxford University Press) 22, no. 3 (August 2010): 673-697.

Barry Brummett. *Rhetoric in Popular Culture*. Austin, Texas: SAGE, 2011.

Barry Brummett. *Techniques of Close Reading*. Thousand Oaks: SAGE, 2010.

Victoria Gallagher and Kenneth S. Zagacki. "Visibility and Rhetoric: The Power of Visual Images in Norman Rockwell's Depictions of Civil Rights." *Quarterly Journal of Speech* (National Communication Association) 91, no. 2 (May 2005): 175-200.

Robert Hariman and John Louis Lucaites. "Public Identity and Collective memory in U.S. Iconic Photography: The Image of "Accidental Napalm"." *Critical Studies in Media Communication* (National Communication Association) 20, no. 1 (March 2003): 35-66.

Robert Hariman and John Louis Lucaites. *No Caption Needed*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 2007.

Christina Smith. "Iconic Images and the Visual Public Sphere." *The Review of Communication* (National Communication Association) 9, no. 1 (January 2009): 72-75.

Annotated list of resources for teachers

Refer to Victoria Gallagher and Kenneth Zagacki for a full discussion on Norman Rockwell's civil rights paintings. Their article gives an excellent critical close reading of the artistic devices used by Rockwell in communicating a rhetorical view of school desegregation and the integration of neighborhoods. This image that appeared in Look magazine was very different than Rockwell's nostalgic images of Americana done as covers for the Saturday Evening Post. In the early 1960's Rockwell had been told by a

critic for the Post that he could not include images of negroes in his illustrations for Post covers unless they were doing menial tasks. His images done in response to civil rights issues appeared inside Look magazine, not the cover, but were artfully constructed to present his democratic point of view.

Library of Congress, Prints and Photographs Catalog, link to full online catalog of archived photographic images.

<http://www.loc.gov/pictures/>

Library of Congress, Prints and Photographs Catalog, a search for “Dorothy Counts” will link to the following iconic photographs from 1957:

*School dilemma--Youths in Charlotte, N.C. taunt Dorothy Geraldine Counts, 15, as she walks to enroll at the previously all-white Harding High School, September 4th

<http://www.loc.gov/pictures/item/96520936/>

*Negro Girl Pelted by Crowd

<http://www.loc.gov/pictures/item/00651018/>

The Online News Hour Extra

<http://www.pbs.org/newshour/extra/teachers/>

This is a convenient and easy to navigate website offering unique current events resources for teachers. News stories are written for a tenth grade reading level. accessed 5/24/2012

Quote by W.H.Auden

http://www.brainyquote.com/quotes/authors/w/w_h_auden.html

"What the mass media offers is not popular art, but entertainment which is intended to be consumed like food, forgotten, and replaced by a new dish." Wystan Hugh Auden, 1907-1973, was an Anglo-American poet and writer. His quote portrays the idea that the media's influence is minimal in the viewers mind. accessed 11/19/12

Dorothy Counts <http://www.loc.gov/pictures/item/96520936/>

The Problem http://www.kingsacademy.com/mhodes/11_Western-Art/27_Popular_Modern-Realism/Rockwell/Rockwell_1964_The-Problems-We-All-Share.jpg

Migrant Mother <http://www.loc.gov/pictures/resource/fsa.8b29516/>

Rihanna, in Rio, 2011

<http://cdn01.cdn.justjared.com/wp-content/uploads/2011/09/rihanna-rio/thumbs/rihanna-airport-rio-de-janeiro-09.jpg>

Annotated resources for students

Animoto

<http://animoto.com>

An online website where you can turn your photos, video clips, and music into stunning video masterpieces to share with everyone. Fast, free, and shockingly easy! accessed 11/19/2012

Creating a video montage.

<http://www.weneedavacation.com/Help/VideoMontage.aspx>

This website is a site dedicated to preserving photographic memories primarily from vacation images, but offers an easy to follow process for creating video montages using a variety of software applications including Movie Maker and iMovie. Great for iPad use. accessed 11/19/2012

¹ Wystan Hugh Auden, http://www.brainyquote.com/quotes/authors/w/w_h_auden.html.

² Barry Brummett, *Techniques of Close Reading* (Thousand Oaks: SAGE, 2010), 3.

³ Ibid

⁴ Sara Blair, "The Photograph's Last Word : Visual CultureStudies Now," *American Literary History* 22, no. 3 (2010): 675.

⁵ Robert Hariman and John Louis Lucaites, *No Caption Needed* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 2007), 27.

⁶ Ibid,10.

⁷ Ibid 13.

⁸ Ibid, 27.

⁹ Ibid

¹⁰ Ibid,1.

¹¹ Ibid,173.

¹² Ibid,

¹³ Ibid, 3.

¹⁴ Christina Smith, "Iconic Images and the Visual Public Sphere," *The Review of Communication* 9, no. 1 (2009): 72.

¹⁵ Ibid

¹⁷ Barry Brummett. *Rhetoric in Popular Culture*. Austin (Texas: SAGE, 2011) 6.

¹⁸ Hariman and Lucaites, *No Caption Needed*, 3.

¹⁹ Blair, "The Photograph's Last Word : Visual CultureStudies Now," 673.

²⁰ Ibid , 674.

²¹ Ibid, 675.

²² Hariman and Lucaites, *No Caption Needed*,, 26.

²³ Ibid, 1.

²⁴ Ibid, 2.

²⁵ Ibid

²⁶ Ibid

-
- 27 Ibid
28 Ibid, 3.
29 Ibid, 17.
30 Ibid, 27.
31 Ibid, 9.
32 Ibid
33 Ibid, 10.
34 Ibid, 11.
35 Ibid
36 Ibid, 16.
37 Ibid, 17.
38 Ibid, 12.
39 Brummett, *Techniques of Close Reading*, 9.
40 Ibid, 12-13.
41 Ibid, 35-36.
42 Hariman and Lucaites, *No Caption Needed*, 29-37.
43 Ibid, 175.
44 Ibid, 33.
45 Ibid, 35.
46 Ibid, 35-36.
47 Ibid, 37.
48 Ibid
49 Ibid, 98.
50 Ibid, 176.
51 Ibid, 55.
52 Ibid., 66.
53 Ibid, 99.
54 Ibid
55 Ibid, 176.
56 Brummett, *Techniques of Close Reading*, 39.
57 Hariman and Lucaites, *No Caption Needed*, 8.
58 Ibid, 131.
59 Ibid, 37.
60 Ibid, 39.
61 Ibid, 12.
62 Robert Hariman and John Louis Lucaites, "Public Identity and Collective memory in U.S. Iconic Photography: The Image of "Accidental Napalm"," *Critical Studies in Media Communication* 20, no. 1 (2003): 39.
63 Ibid, 36.
64 Hariman and Lucaites, *No Caption Needed*, 4.